## Statutory Issue Paper No. 16X

## Updates to the Definition of a Liability

### STATUSExposure Draft – March 22, 2023

**Original and Current Authoritative Guidance: SSAP No. 5R**

Type of Issue:
Common Area

### SUMMARY OF ISSUE

1. This issue paper documents the SAP clarification revisions to *SSAP No. 5R—Liabilities, Contingencies and Impairment of Assets.* The intent of the revisions is to align current statutory accounting guidance, specifically the definition of a “liability,” with the term utilized by the Financial Accounting Standards Board (FASB).

### SUMMARY CONCLUSION

1. The statutory accounting principle clarifications to SSAP No. 5R (illustrated in Exhibit A), reflect that for the purposes of statutory accounting, a liability shall be defined as: a present obligation of an entity to transfer an economic benefit. A liability has two essential characteristics: (1) it is a present obligation, and (2) the obligation requires an entity to transfer or otherwise provide economic benefit to others. For the purposes of these characteristics, *transfer* is typically used to describe obligations to pay cash or convey assets, while the term *provide* is used to describe obligations to provide services or stand by to do so. This includes, but is not limited to, liabilities arising from policyholder obligations (e.g., policyholder benefits, reported claims and reserves for incurred but not reported claims). Liabilities shall be recorded on a reporting entity’s financial statements when incurred.
2. Estimates (e.g., loss reserves) are required in financial statements for many ongoing and recurring activities of a reporting entity. The mere fact that an estimate is involved does not of itself constitute a loss contingency. For example, estimates of losses utilizing appropriate actuarial methodologies meet the definition of liabilities as outlined above and are not loss contingencies. (The definition and recognition requirements of loss contingencies under SSAP No. 5R are not proposed to be revised and will continue as statutory accounting guidance.)

### DISCUSSION

1. In December 2021, FASB issued [*Concepts Statement No. 8, Conceptual Framework for Financial Reporting—Chapter 4, Elements of Financial Statements*](https://www.fasb.org/cs/ContentServer?c=Document_C&pagename=FASB%2FDocument_C%2FDocumentPage&cid=1176179207571), which introduced updated definitions of certain key elements used in financial reporting – most notably updating the fundamental definition of a liability. Through the FASB’s adoption of Concept Statement No. 8, the original Concept Statement No. 6 has been superseded. As statutory accounting currently reflects FASB’s historical definition, this issue paper is to review the prior concept definition (currently utilized by statutory accounting) and compare it to FASB’s updated concept definition and assess whether the revised concept definition shall be reflected in statutory accounting.
2. FASB concept statements do not reflect authoritative U.S. GAAP guidance. Rather concept statements are intended to set forth objectives and fundamental concepts that will be the basis for development of financial accounting and reporting guidance. The term “liability” is not captured or defined in the FASB Accounting Standards Codification (which is the source of authoritative U.S. GAAP.) Furthermore, although the concept statement is intended to be used as a guide in establishing authoritative U.S. GAAP, the FASB is not restricted to the concepts when developing guidance, and the FASB may issue U.S. GAAP which may be inconsistent with the objectives and fundamental concepts set forth in Concept Statements. A change in a FASB Concept Statement does not 1) require a change in existing U.S. GAAP, 2) amend, modify or interpret the Accounting Standards Codification, or 3) justify either changing existing generally accepted accounting and reporting practices or interpreting the Accounting Standards Codification based on personal interpretations of the objectives and concepts in the concepts statement.
3. Under the prior FASB concept statement, which was reflected in SSAP No. 5R, a liability was defined as a probable future sacrifice of economic benefits arising from present obligations of a particular entity to transfer assets or to provide services to other entities in the future as a result of past transactions or events. In addition, the historical definition possessed three essential characteristics in that (1) it embodies a present duty or responsibility to one or more other entities that entails settlement by probable future transfer or use of assets at a specified or determinable date, on occurrence of a specified event, or on demand, (2) the duty or responsibility obligates a particular entity, leaving it little or no discretion to avoid the future sacrifice, and (3) the transaction or other event obligating the entity has already happened.
4. Pursuant to the prior concept statement, and as incorporated in SSAP No. 5R, *probable,* as referenced both in the definition and essential characters, was used in a usual general meaning, rather than in a specific accounting or technical sense and referred to which can reasonably be expected or believed on the basis of available evidence or logic but is neither certain nor proved.
5. With the new FASB conceptual framework chapter, a liability is now defined as a present obligation of an entity to transfer an economic benefit. In addition, the current definition has two essential characteristics in that the liability is (1) a present obligation, and (2) the obligation requires an entity to transfer or otherwise provide economic benefits to others.
6. The updated liability definition from Concept Statement No. 8 no longer includes the term *probable* or the phrase *in the future* and *as a result of past transactions or events.* The FASB concluded that the term *probable* has historically been misunderstood as implying that a future obligation must meet a probability to a certain threshold before the definition of a liability was met. Thus, if the probability of a future transfer of an asset (or the requirement to provide a service) was low, a liability would likely not be recognized. In removing the term *probable* (and replacing it with “present obligation”), FASB concluded that in almost all situations, the presence of an obligation will be apparent. It stated that most present obligations are legally enforceable, including obligations arising from binding contracts, agreements, statutes, or other legal or contractual means. Chapter 4 also discusses the prevalence of certain business risks and how to assess if they result in the recognition of a liability. The FASB concluded that while certain businesses have a risk that a future event will cause them to transfer an economic benefit (an asset), the risk itself does not represent a present obligation because exposure to a potential negative consequence does not constitute a present obligation.
7. However, the FASB also stated that situations lacking clear legal or contractual evidence of a present obligation may pose particular challenges that may make it difficult to discern whether a present obligation exists. In these settings, the FASB stated that constructive obligations or other noncontractual obligations are created by circumstance rather than by explicit agreement. In the absence of an explicit agreement, sufficient information to distinguish a present obligation is likely only available at the specific standards level. Thus, the FASB concluded that the specific facts and circumstances at the standards level (or in the case of statutory accounting, at the SSAP level) must be utilized to determine whether the entity has created a constructive obligation and must recognize a liability.
8. The FASB also struck the phrase *as the result of past transactions or events*. With this action, the FASB clarified that if the liability represents a *present obligation*, by default, the obligation must have occurred as the result of a past transaction or event and thus this phraseology was deemed redundant and unnecessary.
9. When reviewing the substance of the revisions, the FASB concluded that the updated definition resulted in a clearer and more precise definition. Furthermore, while it did not fundamentally change the historical concept of a liability, the revised definition potentially expands the population of liabilities to include certain obligations to issue or potentially issue an entity’s own shares rather than settle an obligation exclusively with assets. In essence, clarifying that instruments with characteristics of both liabilities and equity may in fact be classified as liabilities in certain situations.
10. In general, the FASB did not anticipate that the liability definition revisions would result in any material changes in instrument reclassification (e.g., items now being classified as a liability when previously they were not considered liabilities). Again, FASB Concept Statements are not authoritative and thus the guidance in any specific standard will still be utilized for instrument measurement and classification. For statutory accounting purposes, the updated definition should be viewed similarly, that is it does not change fundamental concepts, change current practices, or introduce a new, original or a modified accounting principle. The revisions to the definition of a liability clarify the definitional language and do not modify the original intent of SSAP No. 5R and thus the changes are deemed to be a statutory accounting principle clarification.
11. The remaining concepts and guidance articulated in SSAP No. 5R (e.g., contingencies, impairments, guarantees, etc.) were not proposed for revision and thus are not further discussed in this issue paper.

Actions of the Statutory Accounting Principles (E) Working Group

1. During the 2022 Spring National Meeting, the Working Group is exposed this issue paper for public comment.
2. During the 2022 Summer National Meeting, the Working Group is re-exposed this issue paper for public comment.
3. At the 2022 Fall National Meeting, the Working Group re-exposed this issue paper related to the definition change of a liability in *SSAP No. 5R—Liabilities, Contingencies and Impairment of Assets.* This exposure intends to provide additional time for industry to review the changes in accordance with statutory accounting statements. NAIC staff were directed to collaborate with interested parties on proposed clarifying language.
4. At the 2023 Spring National Meeting, the Working Group exposed this issue paper with revisions to: 1) add an additional footnote to the definition of a liability in SSAP No. 5R which defers to more topic specific contradictory guidance and 2) revise the relevant literature section of SSAP No. 5R to note the modification*.* These clarifications were because of the authoritative treatment that statutory accounting provides to the definition of an asset and a liability in SSAP No. 4 and SSAP No. 5R. For U.S. GAAP, the FASB Conceptual statements definitions are not authoritative, but rather are concepts to consider when developing and applying guidance. The FASB basis for conclusions noted that some existing authoritative FASB literature regarding liabilities is inconsistent with the updates to Concepts Statement No. 8. Therefore, a modification regarding topic specific liabilities guidance was incorporated to address variations from the definition of a liability. Examples of existing SAP variations from the definition of a liability include but are not limited to:
	1. *SSAP No. 7—Asset Valuation Reserves and Interest Maintenance Reserves* – AVR and IMR establish liabilities for regulatory objectives.
	2. *SSAP No. 62R—Property and Casualty Reinsurance* – contains the provision for reinsurance liability guidance which results in a liability that is a regulatory valuation allowance for overdue and slow paying reinsurance and also enforces credit for reinsurance (*Credit for Reinsurance Model Law* (#785)) collateral requirements.
	3. *SSAP No. 92—Post Retirement Benefits Other than Pensions*, provides liability recognition, which adopts several U.S. GAAP standards with modifications.

### RELEVANT STATUTORY ACCOUNTING AND GAAP GUIDANCE

Statutory Accounting

1. Relevant excerpts of SSAP No. 5R, paragraphs 2-3 regarding the definition of a liability accounting are as follows:
2. A liability is defined as certain or probable[[1]](#footnote-2) future sacrifices of economic benefits arising from present obligations of a particular entity to transfer assets or to provide services to other entities in the future as a result of a past transaction(s) or event(s).
3. A liability has three essential characteristics: (a) it embodies a present duty or responsibility to one or more other entities that entails settlement by probable1 future transfer or use of assets at a specified or determinable date, on occurrence of a specified event, or on demand, (b) the duty or responsibility obligates a particular entity, leaving it little or no discretion to avoid the future sacrifice, and (c) the transaction or other event obligating the entity has already happened. This includes, but is not limited to, liabilities arising from policyholder obligations (e.g., policyholder benefits, reported claims and reserves for incurred but not reported claims). Liabilities shall be recorded on a reporting entity’s financial statements when incurred.

### Generally Accepted Accounting Principles

1. Relevant paragraphs from [*Concepts Statement No. 8, Conceptual Framework for Financial Reporting—Chapter 4, Elements of Financial Statements*](https://www.fasb.org/cs/ContentServer?c=Document_C&pagename=FASB%2FDocument_C%2FDocumentPage&cid=1176179207571)have been included below:

**Liabilities**

E37. A liability is a present obligation of an entity to transfer an economic benefit

**Characteristics of Liabilities**

E38. A liability has the following two essential characteristics: a. It is a present obligation. b. The obligation requires an entity to transfer or otherwise provide economic benefits to others.[[2]](#footnote-3)

E39. Liabilities commonly have features that help identify them. For example, many liabilities require the obligated entity to pay cash to one or more identified other entities. Liabilities may not require an entity to pay cash but may require the entity to convey other assets, provide services, or transfer other economic benefits or to be ready to do so. Liabilities are based on a foundation of legal rights and duties.

E40. Entities routinely incur liabilities in exchange transactions to acquire the funds, goods, and services they need to operate. For example, borrowing cash (acquiring funds) obligates an entity to repay the amount borrowed, acquiring assets on credit obligates an entity to pay for the assets, and selling products with a warranty or guarantee obligates an entity to either pay cash or repair or replace any products that prove defective. Often, obligations incurred in exchange transactions are contractual based on written or oral agreements to pay cash or to provide goods or services to specified or determinable entities on demand at specified or determinable dates or on the occurrence of specified events.

Present obligation

E41. A liability requires that an entity be obligated to perform or act in a certain manner. In most cases it is apparent that liabilities are legally enforceable. Legally enforceable obligations include those arising from binding contracts, agreements, rules, statutes, or other requirements that would be upheld by a judicial system or government. Judicial systems vary in type and form, and the term judicial systems includes any such system that would enforce laws, statutes, and regulations. In the context most relevant to financial reporting, an obligation is any condition that binds an entity to some performance or action. In a financial reporting context, something is binding on an entity if it requires performance. Performance is what the entity is required to do to satisfy the obligation.

E42. Many obligations that qualify as liabilities stem from contracts and other agreements that are enforceable by courts or from governmental actions that have the force of law. Agreements, contracts, or statutory requirements often will specify or imply how an obligation was incurred and when and how the obligation is to be settled. For example, borrowing and lease agreements specify the amount of charges and the dates when the payments are due. The absence of a specified maturity date or event to require settlement may cast doubt that an obligation exists.

E43. Liabilities necessarily involve other parties, society, or law. The identity of the other party or recipient need not be known to the obligated entity before the time of settlement. An obligation of an entity to itself cannot be a liability. For example, in the absence of external requirements an entity is not obligated to repair the roof of its building or maintain its plant and equipment. Although those actions may be wise business moves, the entity may forgo or defer such activities because there is no present obligation to perform the activity.

E44. Certain obligations require nonreciprocal transfers from an entity to one or more other entities. Such obligations include taxes imposed by governments, donations pledged to charitable entities, and cash dividends declared but not yet paid.

E45. To have a liability, an entity must have a present obligation, that is, the obligation exists at the financial statement date. The settlement date of the liability may occur in the future, but the obligation must be present at the financial statement date. Transactions or other events or circumstances expected to occur in the future do not in and of themselves give rise to obligations today.

E46. An intention to purchase an item, for example, an asset, does not in and of itself create a liability. However, a contractual obligation that requires an entity to pay more than the fair value of the asset at the transaction date may create a liability before the asset is received, reflecting what the entity might have to pay to undo the unfavorable contract.

E47. Business risks result from the conduct of an entity’s business activities. A business risk is not a present obligation, though at some point in the future an event may occur that creates a present obligation. Some businesses have the potential of carrying out activities and creating present obligations as a result of those activities. However, no present obligation exists even if it is virtually certain that an obligating event will occur, though at present no such event has occurred. The essence of distinguishing business risks from liabilities is determining the point in time when an entity has a present obligation.

E48. Some business risks result from an entity’s transactions, for example, selling goods in overseas markets might expose an entity to the risk of future cash flow fluctuations because of changes in foreign exchange rates. Other business risks result from an entity’s operating environment, for example, operating in a highly specialized industry might expose an entity to the risk that it will be unable to attract sufficient skilled staff to sustain its operating activities. Those risks are not liabilities.

E49. To be presently obligated, an entity must be bound, either legally or in some other way, to perform or act in a certain way. Most liabilities are legally enforceable, including those arising from contracts, agreements, rules, and statutes. An entity also can become obligated by other means that would be expected to be upheld by a judicial process. However, the existence of a present obligation may be less clear in those circumstances.

E50. Some liabilities rest on constructive obligations, including some that arise in exchange transactions. A constructive obligation is created, inferred, or construed from the facts in a particular situation rather than contracted by agreement with another entity or imposed by government. An entity may become constructively obligated through customary business practice. In the normal course of business, an entity conducting certain activities may not create a clear contractual obligation but may nonetheless cause the entity to become presently obligated. For example, policies and practices for sales returns and those for warranties in the absence of a contract may create a present obligation because the pattern of behavior may create an enforceable claim for performance that would be upheld in the ultimate conclusion of a judiciary process.

E51. An entity’s past behavior also may give rise to a present obligation. Repeated engagement in a certain behavior may obligate the entity to perform or act in a certain way on the basis of that pattern of behavior. For example, the entity may create a constructive obligation to employees for vacation pay or year-end bonuses by paying them every year even though it is not contractually bound to do so and has not announced a policy to do so.

1. The most notable changes regarding the definition of a liability included removal of the term *probable* and the phrase *as a result of past transactions or events.* Rationale for these changes were documented in *Chapter 4, Elements of Financial Statements* commentary as follows:

BC4.11. The definitions of both an asset and a liability in Concepts Statement 6 include the term probable and the phrases future economic benefit and past transactions or events. The term probable in the definitions in Concepts Statement 6 has been misunderstood as implying that a future economic benefit or a future sacrifice of economic benefit must be probable to a certain threshold before the definition of an asset or a liability is met. In other words, if the probability of future economic benefit is low, the asset definition is not met under that interpretation. A similar interpretation could be made for liabilities. The footnotes to the Concepts Statement 6 definition of assets and liabilities also were not helpful in clarifying the application of the term probable as used in the definitions of assets and liabilities. Accordingly, the Board decided to eliminate that term from the definitions of both assets and liabilities.

BC4.12. The term future in the definitions in Concepts Statement 6 focused on identifying a future flow of economic benefits to demonstrate that an asset exists or identifying a future transfer of economic benefits to demonstrate that a liability exists. The definitions in Concepts Statement 6 were often misunderstood as meaning that the asset (liability) is the ultimate future inflow (outflow). For example, in the instance of trade receivables, the definition in Concepts Statement 6 could be misunderstood to indicate that the asset is the successful collection of the receivable in the future. When applied appropriately, however, the definition would conclude that the asset is the present right to collection. Similar misunderstandings occurred in applying the liability definition. As a result, the Board concluded that a focus on the term present would appropriately shift the focus from identifying a future occurrence. Therefore, the Board decided to include the term present right to demonstrate that an asset exists and emphasize the term present obligation to demonstrate that a liability exists.

BC4.13. The definitions of assets and liabilities in Concepts Statement 6 both include the phrase past transactions or events. The Board concluded that if an entity has a present right or a present obligation, one can reasonably assume that it was obtained from some past transaction or event. Therefore, that phrase is considered redundant and has been eliminated from the definitions.

1. The other significant change to the definition of a liability included changing *future sacrifices* to a *present obligation*. Rationale for these changes were documented in *Chapter 4, Elements of Financial Statements* commentary as follows:

BC4.25. The term present obligation is included in the definition of a liability, both in this chapter and in Concepts Statement 6. Because the application of the liability definition under Concepts Statement 6 did not give sufficient emphasis to the term present obligation, the definition in this chapter more appropriately emphasizes that term. Assessing whether a present obligation exists is the primary criterion in the definition of a liability in this chapter. The primacy of the term present obligation is made more evident through the removal of many of the problematic terms in the definition of a liability in Concepts Statement 6, as discussed in paragraphs BC4.11–BC4.13.

BC4.26. Almost always, the existence of a present obligation will be apparent. Most present obligations are legally enforceable, including obligations arising from binding contracts, agreements, statutes, or other legal or contractual means. However, situations lacking clear legal or contractual evidence of a present obligation pose particular challenges that may make it difficult to discern whether a present obligation exists.

BC4.27. Determining when a present obligation exists has caused confusion with the existence of business risks. Business risks result from the nature of the business and where, when, and how an entity conducts its business. While certain businesses pose risks of future events occurring that will cause a transfer of economic benefits, the Board decided that the risks themselves are not present obligations because exposure to a potential negative consequence does not constitute a present obligation. Rather than viewing all business risks as liabilities, the Board decided that an entity has a present obligation only after an event occurs that demonstrates that the inherent business risk has created a present obligation. Thus, distinguishing when a business risk makes an entity presently obligated requires analysis of the facts and circumstances at the standards level.

BC4.28. Determining the existence of a present obligation is particularly challenging in evaluating constructive obligations. Interpreting constructive obligations too narrowly will tend to exclude significant actual obligations of an entity, while interpreting them too broadly will effectively nullify the definition by including items that lack an essential characteristic of liabilities.

BC4.29. Given that constructive obligations and other noncontractual obligations are created by circumstance rather than explicit agreement, it can be unclear whether a present obligation exists. In the absence of an explicit agreement, sufficient information to distinguish a present obligation is likely only available at the specific standards level. Thus, the Board decided that specific facts and circumstances at the standards level must be assessed to determine whether an entity has created a constructive obligation.

### RELEVANT LITERATURE

Statutory Accounting

* Statutory Accounting Principles Statement of Concepts and Statutory Hierarchy

Generally Accepted Accounting Principles

* FASB Statement of Financial Accounting Concepts No. 8, Conceptual Framework for Financial Reporting – Chapter 4, Elements of Financial Statements

**Effective Date**

1. As issue papers are not authoritative and are not represented in the Statutory Hierarchy (see Section V of the Preamble), the consideration and adoption of this issue paper will not have any impact on the SAP clarifications adopted to SSAP No. 5R by the Working Group on TBD.

**EXHIBIT A – SAP Clarification Revisions to *SSAP No. 5R—Liabilities, Contingencies and Impairments of Assets***

**Statement of Statutory Accounting Principles No. 5 - Revised**

**Liabilities, Contingencies and Impairments of Assets**

SCOPE OF STATEMENT

1. This statement defines and establishes statutory accounting principles for liabilities, contingencies and impairments of assets.

## SUMMARY CONCLUSION

### Liabilities

1. A liability is defined as a present obligation of an entity to transfer an economic benefit.
2. A liability[[3]](#footnote-4) has two essential characteristics: (a) it is a present obligation, and (b) the obligation required an entity to transfer or otherwise provide economic benefit to others. This includes, but is not limited to, liabilities arising from policyholder obligations (e.g., policyholder benefits, reported claims and reserves for incurred but not reported claims). Liabilities shall be recorded on a reporting entity’s financial statements when incurred.
3. Estimates (e.g., loss reserves) are required in financial statements for many ongoing and recurring activities of a reporting entity. The mere fact that an estimate is involved does not of itself constitute a loss contingency. For example, estimates of losses utilizing appropriate actuarial methodologies meet the definition of liabilities as outlined above and are not loss contingencies.

### Relevant Literature

39. This statement adopts *FASB Statement No. 5, Accounting for Contingencies* (FAS 5), *FASB Statement 114, Accounting by Creditors for Impairment of a Loan* only as it amends in part FAS 5 *. FASB Interpretation No. 14, Reasonable Estimation of the Amount of a Loss, An Interpretation of FASB Statement No. 5* (FIN No. 14) is adopted with the modification to accrue the loss amount as the midpoint of the range rather than the minimum as discussed in paragraph 3 of FIN No. 14. This statement adopts with modification *ASU 2013-04, Obligations Resulting from Joint and Several Liability Arrangements for Which the Total Amount of the Obligation is Fixed at the Reporting Date* with the same statutory modification adopted for FIN 14. This statement incorporates the definition of a liability from *FASB Statement of Financial Accounting Concepts No. 8, Chapter 4, Elements of Financial Statements,* paragraphs E37 and E38 with modification reflected in this Statement regarding topic specific guidance.

## REFERENCES

### Relevant Issue Papers

1. *Issue Paper No. 5—Definition of Liabilities, Loss Contingencies and Impairments of Assets*
2. *Issue Paper No. 20—Gain Contingencies*
3. *Issue Paper No. 135—Guarantor’s Accounting and Disclosure Requirements for Guarantees, Including Indirect Guarantees of Indebtedness of Others*
4. *Issue Paper No. 16X – Updates to the Definition of a Liability*

https://naiconline.sharepoint.com/teams/FRSStatutoryAccounting/National Meetings/A. National Meeting Materials/2023/3-22-23 - Spring/Exposures/22-01B - IP No. 16X - Liability (3-22).docx

1. *FASB Statement of Financial Accounting Concepts No. 6, Elements of Financial Statements*, states: Probable is used with its usual general meaning, rather than in a specific accounting or technical sense (such as that in *FASB Statement 5, Accounting for Contingencies*, paragraph 3), and refers to that which can reasonably be expected or believed on the basis of available evidence or logic but is neither certain nor proved. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
2. This chapter continues the practice of describing liabilities as an obligation either to transfer or to provide economic benefits. For example, the term transfer has typically been used to describe obligations to pay cash or convey assets, and the term provide has typically been used to describe obligations to perform services or stand ready to do so. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
3. The guidance in this Statement regarding the definition of a liability is applicable unless another authoritative statement of statutory accounting principles provides more topic specific contradictory guidance. In such cases the topic specific guidance shall apply. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)